

Junior Carlton Club
29 Jan 1896

My dear Spencer,
re Anthropology

I must say that I am very disappointed in the first part of this paper — The numerous apologies for the writer's imperfections and for the unreliability of the evidence &c destroy any value the paper may have had. I cannot see any advantage in publishing vague ideas and stating that the information which gave rise to them is absolutely unreliable — it wd. be far better to leave them out altogether and only make such statements as are borne out by reliable evidence.

For instance page 6

"The writer is fully conscious of imperfections &c

Page 7 "The value of the paper
is entirely due to the illustrations"
Page 16 "The native pronouns
the name of Notoyeko -
Urynamata & Okamata

Now I particularly noticed and
drew your attention to the fact
at the time, that while speaking
was always understood the
natives about Urynamata
They invariably pronounced it
Ootakamata and laughed
among themselves at the
whiskers pronunciation

Page 19 "The only features I could
perceive which distinguish
men was the Chignon, this
head dress I did not observe (sic)
among the Amitchas
This leads to my remarkably little
& contradictory

Moreover my own knowledge

35
teaches me that the Chignon
is worn from the Sawtooth
Ranges in the South right
across the Continent - That
is it did do so before the blacks
came into contact with the
whites - it is one of the very
first Customs they abandon
after the contact - My Experi-
ences from 1862

Page 20 "My great regret is
the meagre nature of the information"
All this kind of thing so often
repeated can only depreciate
the whole article.

The statement that two tribes
living side by side & only divided
by an imaginary line (page 18)
are so ignorant of one another's
language that they can only
converse in broken English
is a most extraordinary one
Dob's Jellen confirms this

My own experience of the tribes
inhabiting the Country from
Yorkes Peninsula in So. Austr.
to the Austr. Bight in the West
and Northwards to the peaks
is that although the language
is mainly different still they
can understand one another
and have many words in
common.

The statement that the natives
have a different name for
a mountain & for the waterhole
at the foot of it - is hardly
worth publishing as an
anthropological discovery
It would be very funny if
they called them by the same
name

In fact I think that the
paper up to the heading

35 5

Native population
wants re-drafting, all
about Cattle killing and
the nauseous description
of the distribution of the
Entrails might be omitted
as they are modern habits
or at least might be put in
a more general way.

The purely scientific
portion of the paper I have
no doubt is all right

The Negatives have not
yet arrived — you can get
the drawings lithographed
out there

I have sent you copy of
paper I read at R.C. I
which you can adapt as
a preface so as not to
Clash with your General

Chapter - I want the remarks
as to notes left intact
as I think they express in
a few words a fairly accurate
description of the Aborigine
Woodward and Fagen
of the British Museum
expressed themselves as very
pleased and interested in
the paper.

In regard to your General
Chapter - I wish no
particular reference made
to Mr. Winicete - I consider
he has behaved disgracefully
as under the Article the
whole of his observations
and Journal are my
property and should

have been sent to me ^{and} ^{essentially}
instead of which he has been
endeavouring to sell them to the
Govt after failing to blackmail
me - I have made all
the mention of him that
I wish made -

I will send you all photos
reproduced & also Gillen's
negatives - but if Gillen
wants these for illustration
some other work had be
not better leave them here
or rather get the prints
from the same blocks
it will save him the
cost of new ones

I am going to send
him a complete album
of the Exped. in his own

Photo

Please break my criticisms
gently to Stirling & also
give him a hint that the
British Museum authorities
are very indignant that
nothing has been done with
the Diprotodon bones —
As a matter of fact he is
in rather bad odour
there, someone has told
them the history of the
Notoryctes

Yours sincerely

W. A. Hooten

mem. Don't put Scott Barry's photo
in the book but simply a group
of heads — I enclose mine